

Transcript of Public Meeting

Tuesday, February 22, 2022

Meeting of the Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee

www.trustpoint.one www.aldersonreporting.com 800.FOR.DEPO (800.367.3376) Scheduling@Trustpoint.One

Reference Number: 113182

1	U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY
2	
3	MEETING OF THE DATA PRIVACY AND INTEGRITY ADVISORY
4	COMMITTEE
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	Virtual Meeting
11	10:30 a.m.
12	Tuesday, February 22, 2022
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	U.S. Department of Homeland Security
21	2701 Martin Luther King, Jr., SE, Mail Stop 0655
22	Washington, DC 20598-0655

Public Meeting

2/22/2022 Page 2 (2 - 5)

Page 2	Page 4
1 CONTENTS	any time, please let us know. And please remember
² AGENDA ITEM PAGE	² again to mute your mics until it is time for Q&A or
³ CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL 3	³ public comment session session, sorry.
⁴ OPENING REMARKS 6	The media agenda and the materials for
⁵ CHIEF PRIVACY OFFICER UPDATES 9	⁵ today's session can be found on the DPIAC's
⁶ POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE UPDATE 17	⁶ website. And I will put that in a chat soon, so
⁷ MEMBER QUESTIONS FOR POLICY	you will see it. I will now take a quick roll call
8 SUBCOMITTEE 21	before I turn it over to the committee chairperson,
⁹ EMERGING TECHNOLOGIES	⁹ Lisa Sotto for opening remarks. So with that, I am
¹⁰ SUBCOMMITTEE UPDATE 23	going to start calling on members. Please just
¹¹ MEMBER QUESTIONS FOR EMERGING	11 respond present. Sharon Anolik?
¹² TECHNOLOGIES SUBCOMITTEE 25	Ms. Anolik: Present.
¹³ COMMITTEE TASKING 26	Ms. Taylor: Courtney Barton?
¹⁴ PUBLIC COMMENT 28	Ms. Barton: Present.
¹⁵ CLOSING REMARKS 33	Ms. Taylor: Dennis Dayman?
¹⁶ ADJOURNMENT 34	Mr. Dayman: Present.
17	Ms. Taylor: Michael Fitzpatrick?
18	Mr. Fitzpatrick: Present.
19	Ms. Taylor: Mark Francis?
20	Mr. Francis: Present.
21	Ms. Taylor: Joseph Hewitt?
22	Mr. Hewitt: Present.
Page 3	Page 5
¹ PROCEEDINGS	Ms. Taylor: Sarah Knight? Sarah Knight?
² Ms. Taylor: Good morning, everyone.	² We still have people coming in.
³ Good morning. So we will be starting momentarily.	³ Ms. Knight: Present.
⁴ Our members are just coming in. Welcome to the	4 Ms. Taylor: Thank you, Sarah. John
⁵ public meeting of the Data Privacy and Integrity	⁵ Kropf?
⁶ Advisory Committee.	6 Mr. Kropf: Present.
We are going to start in a couple of	Ms. Taylor: Rosal Marshall?
8 minutes, but we can give our members an opportunity	8 Ms. Marshall: Present.
⁹ to join us. Please keep your mics muted until you	9 Ms. Taylor: Ade Odutola?
¹⁰ are speaking, and that will be done during the	Mr. Odutola: Present.
¹¹ question and answer session. Our members are	Ms. Taylor: Chris Pahl?
¹² coming in. And thank you all very much.	Mr. Pahl: Present.
Thank you for your patience. We want to	13 Ms. Taylor: Charles Palmer?
¹⁴ give it a couple more seconds or minutes, and then	
1 = '	Mr. Palmer: Present.
¹⁵ we are going to get started. Alright. Okay, good	Wit. I diffict. Tresent.
we are going to get started. Alright. Okay, good morning. It is now 10:32 a.m., and this meeting is	Wif. I affilet. Tresent.
16 morning. It is now 10:32 a.m., and this meeting is	Ms. Taylor: Harriet Pearson? Ms. Pearson: Present.
¹⁶ morning. It is now 10:32 a.m., and this meeting is	Ms. Taylor: Harriet Pearson? Ms. Pearson: Present.
morning. It is now 10:32 a.m., and this meeting is called to order. This is the public meeting of the	Ms. Taylor: Harriet Pearson? Ms. Pearson: Present. Ms. Taylor: Tom Plofchan? Mr. Plofchan: Present.
 morning. It is now 10:32 a.m., and this meeting is called to order. This is the public meeting of the Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee, 	Ms. Taylor: Harriet Pearson? Ms. Pearson: Present. Ms. Taylor: Tom Plofchan? Mr. Plofchan: Present. Ms. Taylor: Sasha Romanosky?
 morning. It is now 10:32 a.m., and this meeting is called to order. This is the public meeting of the Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee, better known as the DPIAC. 	Ms. Taylor: Harriet Pearson? Ms. Pearson: Present. Ms. Taylor: Tom Plofchan? Mr. Plofchan: Present. Ms. Taylor: Sasha Romanosky? Mr. Romanosky: Present.
 morning. It is now 10:32 a.m., and this meeting is called to order. This is the public meeting of the Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee, better known as the DPIAC. Again, welcome. We have committee 	Ms. Taylor: Harriet Pearson? Ms. Pearson: Present. Ms. Taylor: Tom Plofchan? Mr. Plofchan: Present. Ms. Taylor: Sasha Romanosky? Mr. Romanosky: Present.

Public Meeting 1 Ms. Taylor: Thomas Siu? 2 Mr. Siu: Present. 3 Ms. Taylor: Chairperson, Lisa Sotto? 4 Ms. Sotto: Good morning. 5 Ms. Taylor: Chris Teitzel? 6 Mr. Teitzel: Present. 7 Ms. Taylor: Great. Ray Thomas? Ray 8 Thomas? 9 (No response.) 10 Ms. Taylor: Surbhi Tugnawat? Surbhi? 11 (No response.) 12 Ms. Taylor: Ron Whitworth? 13 Mr. Whitworth: Present. Good morning. 14 Ms. Taylor: Good morning. Thank you 15 again for joining us today. And now I turn it over ¹⁶ to our committee Chairperson, Lisa Sotto. 17 Ms. Sotto: Alright. Thank you so much, ¹⁸ Sandy, and thank you all for joining us today. ¹⁹ Good morning and welcome to this meeting of the ²⁰ Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee. ²¹ Before we begin, just a couple of housekeeping ²² matters. If I could remind everyone to please mute ¹ your mics for the duration of the presentations. ² There is designated time for committee member

Page 6 Page 8 ¹ we put them upright to indicate a desire to speak, ² but we are going to have to do it a different way ³ for now, and hopefully we will be meeting live soon enough. 5 So there will be time at the end, as I said, for public comments and just send an email to ⁷ that email address. Again, privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov, if you would like to ⁹ submit -- if you would like to ask a question as a member of the public. 10 11 We have a terrific agenda today. Chief ¹² Privacy Officer and Chief Freedom of Information ¹³ Act Officer Lynn Parker Dupree will provide the ¹⁴ committee with an update of the Privacy Office's ¹⁵ activities. And following her presentation, we are ¹⁶ going to receive updates from the Policy and ¹⁷ Emerging Technology subcommittees on their testing ¹⁸ progress. 19 There will be time for committee member

Page 7

³ questions after each presentation. And there is

⁴ also designated time for public comments at the end

⁵ of the session today.

For members of the public who would like ⁷ to address the committee during the public comment ⁸ portion of the session, we ask that you please

⁹ email privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov. I am going to

¹⁰ repeat that, privacycommittee, all one word,

¹¹ privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov.

12 So welcome to returning and to new ¹³ committee members. Chief Privacy Officer Lynn

¹⁴ Parker Dupree and members of the public will join

¹⁵ us hopefully today. Don't know yet about public

¹⁶ comments, but certainly we will have some good

17 presentations.

18 To help us facilitate questions and

¹⁹ comments after each presentation, committee members

²⁰ should use the chat function to indicate that they

²¹ wish to speak. For those of you who have not been

²² to a live meeting, we typically use tent cards and

¹ October 27th, 2020. That is when we got those

²⁰ Q&A after each subcommittee briefing. And as a ²¹ reminder, the tasking information is available on

²² the DPIAC web page under meeting information for

² taskings. Following these discussions, we have

³ reserved time for public comment beginning

⁴ tentatively at 11:50 a.m.

We have not received advance notice from ⁶ anyone wishing to address the committee, so we will ⁷ open the floor to members of the public at that

8 time. But please keep in mind that we may open the ⁹ public comment period early if presentations run

¹⁰ short. So if you have a question, please keep that

11 in mind.

12

Again, please mute your phones and your ¹³ computers, if you are not presenting or speaking or ¹⁴ asking questions during any Q&A period. And now, I

¹⁵ will turn it over to Chief Privacy Officer Lynn

¹⁶ Parker Dupree. Thank you, Lynn.

Ms. Dupree: Thank you so much. Good

¹⁸ morning, everyone, and thank you for joining

¹⁹ today's public meeting of the DPIAC. I am very

²⁰ excited to be able to meet with the committee again

²¹ and provide updates on the Privacy Office's

²² activities and hear updates related to your ongoing

Page 9

Page 10

¹ work on behalf of the Department. I am also

² incredibly excited to congratulate our new and

- ³ returning members on their appointments to the
- ⁴ DPIAC.
- I greatly, greatly value the DPIAC's
- ⁶ contributions to the Department's work in
- ⁷ protecting privacy, and I see the selection of our
- 8 members as an important part of my goal in
- ⁹ improving the Privacy Office's engagement with our
- ¹⁰ important stakeholders. To get us started, I am
- ¹¹ going to give you an update on some of the Privacy
- ¹² Office's most notable achievements over the last
- ¹³ year, as well as one of my priorities moving
- 14 forward.
- 15 I am approaching my one year anniversary
- ¹⁶ as the DHS Chief Privacy Officer, and I am very
- ¹⁷ proud of what we have been able to accomplish and
- ¹⁸ look forward to building on those achievements. As
- ¹⁹ I noted earlier, I am really committed to improving
- ²⁰ the Privacy Office's engagement with our
- ²¹ stakeholders.

22

So in addition to revitalizing the DPIAC,

Page 12

- ¹ privacy officials to ensure that the Headquarters
- ² Privacy Office is aware of any evolving issues and
- ³ to provide assistance when necessary. I have also
- ⁴ been proud to highlight DHS's approach to privacy
- ⁵ as a speaker at many events, including the
- ⁶ intelligence community's Privacy and Civil
- ⁷ Liberties Summit, events hosted by the
- ⁸ International Association of Privacy Professionals,
- ⁹ the Federal Privacy Summit hosted by the Federal
- ¹⁰ Privacy Council, as well as others.
- Over the last year, the Privacy Office
- ¹² has also helped to shape the Department's response
- ¹³ to a number of activities that have significant
- ¹⁴ privacy implications, such as ensuring our
- ¹⁵ community and workforce health during the pandemic,
- ¹⁶ again, responding to domestic -- to domestic
- ¹⁷ violent extremism, and focusing on the use of
- ¹⁸ emerging technologies.
- As many of you may know, the Privacy
- ²⁰ Office basically identifies and we address our
- ²¹ privacy risks through our privacy compliance
- ²² documentation process, and the secretary has sent a

Page 11

22

Page 13

2/22/2022 Page 4 (10 - 13)

- ¹ we have rebuilt our relationship with our external
- ² privacy advocates and brought a diversity of
- ³ opinions to the Department's policy discussions
- ⁴ through those external engagements. This included
- ⁵ arranging an opportunity for privacy advocates to
- ⁶ discuss their priorities directly with Secretary
- ⁷ Mayorkas.
- I have also held several other meetings
- ⁹ with privacy advocates and DHS leaders to better
- ¹⁰ understand their positions regarding critical DHS
- ¹¹ activities, like our efforts to combat domestic
- ¹² violent extremism and other important operations
- ¹³ that intimately impact the public.
- And while our stakeholders positions may
- 15 not always be aligned with that of the Department,
- ¹⁶ these discussions ensure that a diversity of
- ¹⁷ opinions are included in our thinking and really
- ¹⁸ help improve our decision making. I also focused
- ¹⁹ on strengthening the Privacy Office's relationship
- ²⁰ with the component Privacy Officers as well as
- ²¹ other Federal agencies.
- 22 So I regularly meet with component

- ¹ clear message about the importance of including the
- Privacy Office in these policy discussions.
- Additionally, I have really tried to
- ⁴ spend some time embedding resiliency into the
- ⁵ Privacy Office's operations. So in addition to
- ⁶ developing a culture that supports and values
- ⁷ promoting training and expanding the professional
- development of the staff, I also supported the
- ⁹ engagement of the Chief Financial Officers Program
- ¹⁰ Analysis and Evaluation Office to develop and
- ¹¹ create a staffing allocation model, and this model
- ¹² accounts for all of the office's workflows and
- ¹³ helps us plan to better meet our work demands.
 - We have also brought on several new
- ¹⁵ members to the Privacy Office staff, and we are
- ¹⁶ working on several other hiring actions to increase
- ¹⁷ resiliency. And before I move on to the Privacy
- ¹⁸ Officer's priorities for the next year, I do want
- ¹⁹ to recognize my dual role as the Chief Privacy
- ²⁰ Officer and the Chief FOIA Officer and share some
- ²¹ exciting news about DHS FOIA operations.
 - The Department ended the last fiscal year

Page 14

¹ with the lowest backlog in almost a decade. In

² achieving this milestone, we processed a record

- ³ number of -- a record breaking number of requests.
- ⁴ And I am particularly proud of the way that we used
- ⁵ our FOIA resources in the Privacy Office, not only
- ⁶ to handle our own workload, but to also help other
- ⁷ components close out many of their requests.
- Now, I would like to move on to some
- ⁹ Privacy Office priorities for Fiscal Year 2022.
- ¹⁰ One of my top priorities is to shift privacy
- ¹¹ implementation from being solely focused on
- ¹² governance, which is extremely important and
- 13 remains to be invaluable, but to also include
- ¹⁴ privacy in the technical design.
- 15 The Privacy Office is working with DHS
- ¹⁶ stakeholders to host a workshop in June of 2022
- ¹⁷ that will enable privacy researchers to identify
- ¹⁸ DHS use cases that could be solved with privacy
- ¹⁹ enhancing technologies. And then what we can do is
- ²⁰ then connect that -- those discoveries with the
- ²¹ program offices so that they can be used in
- ²² building out our programs and our operations.

Page 15

- Now, I understand that these research
- ² initiatives are not going to happen overnight, but
- ³ it is something we need to start thinking about now
- ⁴ and seek over the long haul if we are going to
- ⁵ ensure that Privacy Office moves into the future
- ⁶ and that we are able to respond proactively instead
- ⁷ of reactively. Another priority I have for Fiscal
- ⁸ Year 2022 is the expansion of the tool we use to
- ⁹ track our privacy compliance documentation and that
- ¹⁰ tool is called PRIVCATS.
- 11 And we are exploring how we can use this
- ¹² tool to help the Privacy Office in its other
- ¹³ requirements and functions, including our
- ¹⁴ congressional reporting, including responding to
- ¹⁵ the recommendations from OIG or from GAO. I see
- 16 this as a -- this update as a valued opportunity to
- ¹⁷ embed technology assisted documentation of the
- ¹⁸ Department's programs and the systems in our
- ¹⁹ processes, and it will allow the Department to
- ²⁰ gather necessary information from the programs and
- ²¹ then store that in a centralized location.
- 22 And finally, I am focused on the launch

Page 16

- ¹ of the new DHS FOIA processing solution. It is
- ² called Secure Release. And Secure Release will
- ³ help us meet the demands of a modern FOIA program
- ⁴ and provide us with the tools we need to serve the
- ⁵ Department and the public. It will enable us to
- ⁶ reduce the number of FOIA processing systems that
- ⁷ exist across the Department and will help us ensure
- 8 that any system that is in use is interoperable and
- ⁹ improve the consistency of our redactions across
- ¹⁰ components.
- 11 And to the committee members, I want to
- 12 thank you all for your time and your dedication,
- ¹³ and I am really looking forward to leveraging your
- ¹⁴ expertise to provide tangible and achievable
- ¹⁵ recommendations to the Department. I am very
- ¹⁶ excited to have the opportunity to work with you
- ¹⁷ all. Thank you.
- 18 Ms. Sotto: Do we have any questions?
- ¹⁹ Committee members -- okay, I don't see any hands
- ²⁰ raised. Thank you so much. We really appreciate
- ²¹ the update, and I will say that I think there is
- ²² great enthusiasm for revitalizing the committee and

Page 17

- ¹ helping you do your work and helping the Privacy
- ² Office generally. So please, please, please use us
- ³ as you wish. We are here and we are here to help.
- ⁴ So thank you so much. There was a terrific update,
- ⁵ and we appreciate it.
 - Alright. So now it is time for a
- ⁷ briefing from the DPIAC Policy Subcommittee Chair
- ⁸ Dennis Dayman. Mr. Dayman is going to provide the
- ⁹ committee with an update on the information sharing
- tasking. So, Dennis, let me turn it over to you.
- 11 Mr. Dayman: Thank you, Lisa. I
- ¹² appreciate that. Hello, everyone. Welcome. I am
- ¹³ glad to see that we are all back here. Yes, what
- ¹⁴ we wanted to do today was to kind of give you an
- ¹⁵ idea of where we are with our tasking.
- 16 As you are aware, and I will kind of
- ¹⁷ review this very quickly, is that the DPIAC was
- ¹⁸ tasked with providing recommendations obviously to
- ¹⁹ the Privacy Office on how to better oversee
- ²⁰ information sharing across the Department of
- ²¹ Homeland Security offices and components. 22 This tasking, as Lisa has mentioned,

Page 18

¹ began on October 27th of 2020, when they asked

- ² DPIAC to provide guidance and information sharing
- ³ specifically on a couple of different points. They
- ⁴ -- it was asked to have written guidance on best
- ⁵ practices, again, to ensure the effective
- ⁶ implementation of privacy requirements for
- ⁷ information sharing within the DHS enterprise.
- And at the time, the Privacy Office asked
- ⁹ that, how can DHS Privacy Office better engage with
- ¹⁰ their own offices and components to improve
- ¹¹ consistency in meeting information sharing
- ¹² requirements that are related to privacy? Number
- 13 two, how can the DHS Privacy Office provide better
- ¹⁴ oversight of privacy protections included in
- 15 information sharing agreements? And were there any
- ¹⁶ sort of specific metrics that can be utilized and
- ¹⁷ written in those agreements to make sure that there
- ¹⁸ is compliance within those?
- 19 And then third, were there any other
- ²⁰ considerations necessary to effectively implement
- ²¹ privacy requirements to DHS sharing information?
- ²² Again, this tasking was assigned to the policy
- Page 19
- ¹ subcommittee, and I myself along with committee
- ² members spent a great amount of time meeting over
- ³ the last year or so, not only with ourselves and
- ⁴ staff being a part of that, but also taking the
- ⁵ time to look at several different processes, but
- ⁶ also a lot of document requests into DHS staff so
- ⁷ that we could sort of see what the -- what we
- 8 needed to understand.
- As a very quick sort of key example is in
- ¹⁰ those documents. We looked at everything from the
- ¹¹ Office of Inspector General's report that came out
- ¹² in November of 2020 and several other management
- ¹³ directives and policy directives that we felt would
- ¹⁴ help us understand the processes within DHS, and
- ¹⁵ again its partners, in handling privacy and
- ¹⁶ managing it, monitoring it, and then continually
- ¹⁷ looking at it every couple of years. Again, you
- ¹⁸ know, spending a lot of time, you know, with the
- ¹⁹ committee, we basically made some recommendations
- ²⁰ so far in this report.
- 21 This report has actually been submitted
- ²² over for review. It was submitted in November of

- ¹ last year, but when we sort of take a look at it
- ² from very high level, the report reflects a
- ³ detailed review by the committee of the current
- ⁴ status of information sharing practices and
- ⁵ provides what we think are recommendations that
- ⁶ would help promote consistency in baseline privacy
- ⁷ controls for those information sharing and then
- ⁸ facilitate oversight by the Privacy Office across
- ⁹ all, again, those information sharing activities,
- ¹⁰ and really to achieve better engagement across the
- ¹¹ DHS offices and its components.
- Very quickly, just on a high level,
- ¹³ again, some of the things that we are looking at
- ¹⁴ doing was looking at adopting template information
- sharing and access agreements known as ISAAs, and
- ¹⁶ privacy addendums that can be included in existing
- ¹⁷ and future sharing agreements that would involve
- ¹⁸ PII or personal identifiable information, and other
- things as well.

20

- With these core capabilities in place, we
- ²¹ believe that the Privacy Office will be able to
- ²² engage, again, with its appropriate stakeholders

Page 21

Page 20

- ¹ across the offices within DHS and components to
- provide even things like training and awareness,
- ³ leading to increased adoption and compliance when
- ⁴ it comes to privacy.
- I am trying to think here -- really at
- ⁶ this point, like I said, we have submitted the
- ⁷ report over to the staff and to the committee in
- ⁸ November, and we are looking forward to actually
- ⁹ bringing this to the much higher DPIAC committee
- ¹⁰ for discussion and for input as well.
- 11 So Lisa, I will turn it back over to you
- 12 then.
- Ms. Sotto: Okay, I am going to ask for
- ¹⁴ questions. Any questions at all? No member 15
- questions for Dennis.
- 16 Mr. Plofchan: Lisa, just a quick one.
- Do we have a timeline on that larger conversation
- with the greater committee?
- 19 Ms. Taylor: Hey, this is Sandy. Lisa, I
- ²⁰ am happy to jump in --21
 - Ms. Sotto: Yes, please.
 - Ms. Taylor: Thank you so much. So as

22

¹ you know, we actually had to wait until we had new ² members seated.

And now that that is done, I am going to

⁴ have a conversation with the Chief -- with Lynn

⁵ Parker Dupree, the Chief Privacy Officer, and we

⁶ will come up with a time when we can have another

⁷ public meeting, possibly within the next two

8 months, so the committee can vote on these

⁹ recommendations.

10 Mr. Plofchan: Excellent. Thank you.

11 Ms. Taylor: You are welcome, Tom.

12 Thanks, Lisa.

13 Ms. Sotto: Okay. Any other questions?

¹⁴ I don't see any hands raised or feel free, if you

¹⁵ are committee member, to jump right in. Okay. And

¹⁶ just a reminder that we will take public comments

¹⁷ at the end of today's session.

So if there are no more questions for

¹⁹ Subcommittee Chair Dayman, I will turn it over now

²⁰ to the Emerging Technologies Subcommittee

²¹ Chairperson Chris Teitzel for an update on that

²² committee's tasking. Chris, over to you.

Page 23

1 Mr. Teitzel: Thanks, Lisa. So the

² subcommittee met several times over the last year ³ and a half to discuss a tasking also from the 27th,

⁴ same time that the policy subcommittee also had

⁵ their tasking. Ours was a bit interesting of a

⁶ tasking because it was a tasking to find a tasking.

The tasking itself was to consider the

⁸ Department's transition to cloud service

⁹ technologies and enhanced capabilities that the

¹⁰ transition provided during the Department's COVID-

¹¹ 19 telework, you know, migration that they

12 underwent at the beginning of the pandemic.

As an overview, the Department saw a 7x

¹⁴ increase in the number of Tesla workers, a 200

¹⁵ percent increase in traffic, and the VPN usage

¹⁶ increased by 483 percent. So a massive shift, as

¹⁷ we all did during the pandemic, to remote work and

18 telework.

19 And the consideration was, what does --

²⁰ what impact does that have on data, and not only

²¹ the privacy of the data, but the integrity as

²² various systems during that telework migration were

Page 24

¹ also being moved to cloud environments as well, and

² that had been happening for quite a while. Luckily

³ for the Department, during the winter, snowstorm of

⁴ 2018, 2019, a large shift had already occurred

⁵ during that time, so much of the rough spots were

⁶ found and attended to during that transition in

⁷ 2018, 2019.

And so from that, you know, the

⁹ transition actually went very smooth. So the

10 committee met with the Office of the Chief

¹¹ Information Officer, the OCIO, office and

¹² representatives there. Now, we got briefings on

¹³ cloud systems that were currently migrated, going

¹⁴ to be migrated, and ones that were tagged for not

15 to be migrated and to stay in localized data

16 centers.

17 We went through with those individuals

¹⁸ and then we had discussions internally on the

¹⁹ various risks of what cloud migration entails, how

²⁰ data moving from one source to the other can then

²¹ be exposed, and how to take certain precautions

²² around that. We found that because this was a

Page 25

2/22/2022 Page 7 (22 - 25)

¹ tasking -- for a tasking, there wasn't as much

² follow on that needed to happen.

And so we put all that together into a

⁴ report. That report has been passed over to the

⁵ Privacy Office, and now we are working with Sandra

⁶ and others to, like I have mentioned earlier, we

⁷ will be scheduling the meeting for a larger

discussion with the group as well.

And so at this time, the report is

¹⁰ written and ready to go, though as we bring on new

11 members, I am sure there is going to be new input

12 that we will likely get, and we are looking forward

13 to having it.

And so, you know, before that meeting, it

¹⁵ would be great to have any new members of the

¹⁶ Emerging Technology Subcommittee take a review of

that and offer any advice as well.

Ms. Sotto: Thank you so much, Chris. Is

¹⁹ there anyone on the committee who would like to ask

²⁰ the question of Chris? And I will remind committee

²¹ members, please, to email Sandy, you can certainly

²² copy me if you like, with your selection for the

18

2/22/2022 Page 8 (26 - 29)

Page 28

Page 26

- ¹ Policy Committee or the Technology Policy
- ² Subcommittee or the Technology Subcommittee.
- We would love to be able to get as many
- ⁴ people their choice of subcommittee as we can. And
- ⁵ so please let us know. Anything else from the
- ⁶ committee? Okay. If there are no more questions
- ⁷ for Subcommittee Chair Teitzel, I will turn it over
- ⁸ now to Chief Privacy Officer Lynn Parker Dupree to
- ⁹ issue a new committee tasking.
- Ms. Dupree: Thank you. This tasking is
- ¹¹ focused on the Department's use of commercial data
- $^{12}\,$ and will be the third time the DPIAC examines this
- 13 topic.
- The DPIAC first analyzed the Department's
- ¹⁵ use of commercial data in 2005 and was focused on
- ¹⁶ the Department -- how the Department might use
- ¹⁷ commercial data to reduce false positives in its
- ¹⁸ screening programs and outline controls to help
- ¹⁹ protect privacy in those circumstances. The DPIAC
- ²⁰ issued a subsequent report in 2006, which built on
- ²¹ the work conducted in 2005 and made additional
- ²² recommendations.

- Page 27
- Some of those recommendations were
- ² definitional and others provided insights on how to
- ³ leverage our compliance documentation process to
- ⁴ analyze commercial data use. Since 2006, the DPIAC
- ⁵ has not produced any additional recommendations
- ⁶ related to commercial data.
- ⁷ In the interim, the sources and uses of
- ⁸ commercial data have both advanced and expanded.
- ⁹ To that end, I am tasking the DPIAC to build upon
- ¹⁰ the previous reports to provide their views and
- 11 recommendations on a governance policy and
- 12 framework wedded to the use of commercial data and
- ¹³ DHS programs.
- I eagerly await your recommendations and
- ¹⁵ analysis.
- Ms. Sotto: Thank you very much. We
- ¹⁷ appreciate that, and we are eagerly looking forward
- ¹⁸ to diving in. Sandy, could I ask that you please
- ¹⁹ send to committee members the prior reports, the
- $^{\rm 20}\,$ 2005 and 2006 reports on the use of commercial
- ²¹ data?
- Ms. Taylor: I will. Lisa, along with

- ¹ that, the new tasking. And also just for our
- ² members of the public, this new tasking will be
- ³ made available immediately following this meeting
- ⁴ on the DPIAC's website.
 - Ms. Sotto: Okay. That is perfect.
- ⁶ Thank you so much. And as I said, we are eager to
- ⁷ dove in, so we will do so and then organize which
- ⁸ subcommittee will be taking this particular
- ⁹ tasking. Okay. Are there any questions for Lynn
- ¹⁰ before we move on?
 - (No response.)
- Ms. Sotto: Okay. And that was questions
- ¹³ from the committee. Okay. So let's go ahead and
- ¹⁴ move on. Sandy, I am not aware that anybody has
- ¹⁵ pre-registered. Has anything come in?
- Ms. Taylor: No. So we do not have
- ¹⁷ anyone who pre-registered for public comment.
- ¹⁸ However, we can open it up at this time for any
- ¹⁹ member of the public who has a question either for
- ²⁰ our Chief Privacy Officer or our members. Okay, I
- ²¹ see that Mr. Myerson has a question.
- Mr. Myerson: Yes, hello. Good morning.

Page 29

- ¹ I did pre-register in that requested comment, so I
- ² thank you for giving me the floor. Hi, my name is
- ³ Ted Myerson. I am the President and Co-founder of
- ⁴ Anonos. And Anonos applauds the DHS's focus on
- ⁵ reviewing advanced PTs in the age -- the rapid age
- ⁶ of digital transformation. There is not one
- ⁷ solution that solves every use case.
- 8 However, we recommend that the DHS
- ⁹ research the benefits of dynamic pseudonymization
- ¹⁰ technology. As recently recognized by the World
- ¹¹ Economic Forum, the European Data Protection
- ¹² Supervisor known as the EDPS, and the European Data
- ¹³ Protection Board known as the EDPB, as really one
- ¹⁴ of the most cutting edge tools to eliminate
- ¹⁵ unnecessary tradeoffs between data privacy and
- ¹⁶ utility.
- 17 It is really one of the most advanced
- ¹⁸ forms of data protection by design by default, and
- ¹⁹ we believe it is one of the DHS's top priorities to
- ²⁰ evaluate technology that is more than just by
- ²¹ design, but rather is implemented at the earliest
- ²² possible point by default.

So just as the use is dynamic in today's ² world, effective data protection must be dynamic to ³ protect data when it is in use so it can travel ⁴ safely beyond companies and Government offices ⁵ perimeters, for protected processing in the cloud ⁶ and sharing, and combining among partners and

⁷ organizations. And just for some brief background, the ⁹ European data privacy regulators, the EDPB and the ¹⁰ EDPS, have highlighted pseudonymizations as the ¹¹ only solution to lawfully transfer data ¹² internationally and lawfully process EU data and

¹³ the U.S. operated clouds. 14 And the World Economic Forum just ¹⁵ highlighted pseudonymization as a fourth industrial ¹⁶ revolution technology capable of resolving these ¹⁷ conflicts between data use and protection. So as ¹⁸ dynamic pseudonymization technology enables ¹⁹ surveillance proof processing while maintaining ²⁰ maximum utility and 100 percent accuracy of the ²¹ data when compared to processing in unprotected 22 clear text.

Page 30

¹ Again, we can -- do we have any public comments,

² any additional public comments? Mr. Myerson, you

³ can actually lower your hand. Thank you, sir. Any

⁴ additional comments? Okay, Davis Phillips has a

⁵ comment.

Mr. Phillips: Yes, just a quick ⁷ question. This is -- I am new to the committee and publicly attending, so thank you for letting me ⁹ join. Very succinctly, is there any mission that ¹⁰ we have as a committee to influence or to steer the ¹¹ development of privacy legislation at the national 12 level?

13 Ms. Sotto: No, that is not our charge. ¹⁴ Our charge is to work directly with the Privacy ¹⁵ Office at DHS and to assist the Chief Privacy ¹⁶ Officer and the Secretary. Lynn, please chime in ¹⁷ there.

18 Ms. Dupree: That is correct. The scope ¹⁹ of the committee's functions is to directly respond ²⁰ to the Department's needs and tasking as issued by the Secretary or the Chief Privacy Officer. 22

Mr. Phillips: Okay, thank you.

Page 31

Page 33

2/22/2022

And so some of these benefits, they don't ² require the heavy processing and transmission, such ³ as homomorphic encryption or multi-party computing ⁴ that can be used in some of these most advanced ⁵ analytics, such as like AI, ML, without ⁶ compromising speed, utility, or accuracy. And this ⁷ also defeats the unauthorized linking to identity

So to conclude here, any long term ¹⁰ sustainable approach to balancing data privacy, ¹¹ protection, and national security should include

¹² dynamic pseudonymization that satisfies the

¹³ highlighted and heightened requirements and ¹⁴ delivering the significant benefits recently

¹⁵ highlighted by the EDPS, the EDPB, and the World

¹⁶ Economic Forum. Thank you.

⁸ known as the mosaic effect.

17 Ms. Sotto: Thank you very much, Mr. ¹⁸ Myerson. We appreciate your comments, and

¹⁹ certainly those are exciting developments, and we

²⁰ will take your comments under advisement. Thank ²¹ you. Sandy, are there any other public comments?

22 Ms. Taylor: No, I don't have any. Ms. Sotto: Thank you very much, Mr.

² Phillips. Any other questions from members of the 3 public?

(No response.)

Ms. Sotto: Okay. If there is anything

⁶ else that -- please do feel free to submit written

⁷ comments. You can submit them to the same email ⁸ address, it is privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov. We ask

⁹ that you please submit those by March 3rd, with

10 respect to written comments that are specific to

¹¹ this meeting.

12 Please keep in mind that we operate as a

¹³ Federal advisory committee under the Federal

¹⁴ Advisory Committee Act, so all written comments are

¹⁵ treated as public documents and will be available

¹⁶ for public inspection.

And with that, many thanks to Chief

¹⁸ Privacy Officer Lynn Parker Dupree, committee

¹⁹ members, and members of the public for

²⁰ participating in today's meeting.

21 This concludes today's meeting. We are ²² grateful for your interest. We encourage you to

	Page 34	
1	follow the committee's work by checking our web	
	page, and the minutes of today's meeting will be	
	posted there in the near future.	
4		
5	Thank you.	
6	(Whereupon, at 11:05 a.m., the meeting	
7	was adjourned.)	
8	was adjourned.)	
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		

WORD INDEX
<0> 0655 1:21
<1> 10:30 1:11 10:32 3:16 100 30:20 11:05 34:6 11:50 9:4 17 2:6 19 23:11
<2> 200 23:14 2005 26:15, 21 27:20 2006 26:20 27:4, 20 2018 24:4, 7 2019 24:4, 7 2020 9:1 18:1 19:12 2022 1:12 14:9, 16 15:8 20598-0655 1:22 21 2:8 22 1:12 23 2:10 25 2:12 26 2:13 2701 1:21 27th 9:1 18:1 23:3 28 2:14
<3> 3 2:3 33 2:15 34 2:16 3rd 33:9
<4> 483 23:16
<6> 6 2:4
<7> 7x 23:13
<9> 9 2:5
<a> a.m 1:11 3:16 9:4 34:6 able 9:20 10:17 15:6 20:21 26:3 access 20:15 accomplish 10:17 accounts 13:12 accuracy 30:20 31:6 achievable 16:14 achieva 20:10

```
achievements 10:12, 18
achieving 14:2
Act 8:13 33:14
actions 13:16
activities 8:15 9:22
11:11 12:13 20:9
addendums 20:16
addition 10:22 13:5
additional 26:21 27:5
32:2, 4
Additionally 13:3
address 7:7 8:7 9:6
12:20 33:8
Ade 5:9
adjourned 34:4, 7
ADJOURNMENT 2:16
adopting 20:14
adoption 21:3
advance 9:5
advanced 27:8 29:5, 17
31:4
advice 25:17
advisement 31:20
ADVISORY 1:3 3:6, 18
6:20 33:13, 14
advocates 11:2, 5, 9
age 29:5
agencies 11:21
AGENDA 2:2 4:4 8:11
agreements 18:15, 17
20:15, 17
ahead 28:13
AI 31:5
aligned 11:15
allocation 13:11
allow 15:19
Alright 3:15 6:17 17:6
amount 19:2
Analysis 13:10 27:15
analytics 31:5
analyze 27:4
analyzed 26:14
anniversary 10:15
Anolik 4:11, 12
Anonos 29:4
answer 3:11
anybody 28:14
applauds 29:4
appointments 10:3
appreciate 16:20 17:5,
12 27:17 31:18
approach 12:4 31:10
approaching 10:15
appropriate 20:22
arranging 11:5
asked 18:1, 4, 8
asking 9:14
assigned 18:22
assist 32:15
assistance 12:3
```

```
assisted 15:17
Association 12:8
attended 24:6
attending 32:8
available 8:21 28:3
33:15
await 27:14
aware 12:2 17:16 28:14
awareness 21:2
< B >
back 17:13 21:11
background 30:8
backlog 14:1
balancing 31:10
Barton 4:13, 14
baseline 20:6
basically 12:20 19:19
began 18:1
beginning 9:3 23:12
behalf 10:1
believe 20:21 29:19
benefits 29:9 31:1, 14
best 18:4
better 3:19 11:9 13:13
17:19 18:9, 13 20:10
beyond 30:4
bit 23:5
Board 29:13
breaking 14:3
brief 30:8
briefing 8:20 17:7
briefings 24:12
bring 25:10
bringing 21:9
brought 11:2 13:14
build 27:9
building 10:18 14:22
built 26:20
< C >
CALL 2:3 4:7
called 3:17 15:10 16:2
calling 4:10
Cameron 5:21
capabilities 20:20 23:9
capable 30:16
cards 7:22
case 29:7
cases 14:18
centers 24:16
centralized 15:21
certain 24:21
certainly 7:16 25:21
31:19
Chair 17:7 22:19 26:7
chairperson 4:8 6:3, 16
22:21
charge 32:13, 14
Charles 5:13
```

chat 4:6 7:20 checking 34:1 **CHIEF** 2:5 7:13 8:11, 12 9:15 10:16 13:9, 19, 20 22:4, 5 24:10 26:8 28:20 32:15, 21 33:17 chime 32:16 **choice** 26:4 Chris 5:11 6:5 22:21, 22 25:18, 20 circumstances 26:19 Civil 12:6 clear 13:1 30:22 **close** 14:7 CLOSING 2:15 **cloud** 23:8 24:1, 13, 19 30:5 **clouds** 30:13 Co-founder 29:3 **combat** 11:11 combining 30:6 come 22:6 28:15 comes 21:4 coming 3:4, 12 5:2 **COMMENT** 2:14 4:3 7:7 9:3, 9 28:17 29:1 32:5 comments 7:4, 16, 19 8:6 22:16 31:18, 20, 21 32:1, 2, 4 33:7, 10, 14 commercial 26:11, 15, 17 27:4, 6, 8, 12, 20 committed 10:19 **COMMITTEE** 1:*4* 2:*13* 3:6, 18, 20 4:8 6:16, 20 7:2, 7, 13, 19 8:14, 19 9:6, 20 16:11, 19, 22 17:9 19:1, 19 20:3 21:7, 9, 18 22:8, 15 24:10 25:19, 20 26:1, 6, 9 27:19 28:13 32:7, 10 33:13, 14, 18 **committee's** 22:22 32:19 34:1 community 12:15 community's 12:6 companies 30:4 compared 30:21 **compliance** 12:21 15:9 18:18 21:3 27:3 **component** 11:20, 22 **components** 14:7 16:10 17:21 18:10 20:11 21:1 compromising 31:6 computers 9:13 computing 31:3 conclude 31:9 concludes 33:21 conducted 26:21 conflicts 30:17

achieve 20:10

congratulate 10:2 congressional 15:14 **connect** 14:20 consider 23:7 consideration 23:19 considerations 18:20 **consistency** 16:9 18:11 20:6 CONTENTS 2:1 continually 19:16 contributions 10:6 controls 20:7 26:18 conversation 21:17 22:4 copy 25:22 core 20:20 **correct** 32:18 **Council** 12:10 **couple** 3:7, 14 6:21 18:3 19:17 Courtney 4:13 **COVID** 23:10 **create** 13:11 critical 11:10 culture 13:6 current 20:3 currently 24:13 **cutting** 29:14

< D > **DATA** 1:3 3:5, 18 6:20 23:20, 21 24:15, 20 26:11, 15, 17 27:4, 6, 8, 12, 21 29:11, 12, 15, 18 30:2, 3, 9, 11, 12, 17, 21 31:10 **Davis** 32:4 **Dayman** 4:15, 16 17:8, 11 22:19 **DC** 1:22 **decade** 14:1 decision 11:18 dedication 16:12 default 29:18, 22 defeats 31:7 definitional 27:2 delivering 31:14 **demands** 13:13 16:3 **Dennis** 4:15 17:8, 10 21:15 **DEPARTMENT** 1:1, 20 10:1 11:15 13:22 15:19 16:5, 7, 15 17:20 23:13 24:3 26:16 **Department's** 10:6 11:3 12:12 15:18 23:8, 10 26:11, 14 32:20 design 14:14 29:18, 21

develop 13:10 developing 13:6 **development** 13:8 32:11 developments 31:19 **DHS** 10:16 11:9, 10 13:21 14:15, 18 16:1 18:7, 9, 13, 21 19:6, 14 20:11 21:1 27:13 29:8 32:15 **DHS's** 12:4 29:4, 19 **different** 8:2 18:3 19:5 difficulties 3:22 digital 29:6 directives 19:13 directly 11:6 32:14, 19 discoveries 14:20 discuss 11:6 23:3 **discussion** 21:10 25:8 discussions 9:2 11:3, 16 13:2 24:18 diversity 11:2, 16 diving 27:18 document 19:6 documentation 12:22 15:9, 17 27:3 documents 19:10 33:15 **doing** 20:14 domestic 11:11 12:16 dove 28:7 **DPIAC** 3:19 8:22 9:19 10:4, 22 17:7, 17 18:2 21:9 26:12, 14, 19 27:4, **DPIAC's** 4:5 10:5 28:4 dual 13:19 **Dupree** 7:14 8:13 9:16, 17 22:5 26:8, 10 32:18 33:18 duration 7:1

eager 28:6
eagerly 27:14, 17
earlier 10:19 25:6
earliest 29:21
early 9:9
Economic 29:11 30:14
31:16
edge 29:14
EDPB 29:13 30:9 31:15
EDPS 29:12 30:10
31:15
effect 31:8
effective 18:5 30:2
effectively 18:20

efforts 11:11

either 28:19

eliminate 29:14

dvnamic 29:9 30:1, 2,

18 31:*12*

<E>

email 7:9 8:6, 7 25:21 33:7 **embed** 15:17 embedding 13:4 **EMERGING** 2:9, 11 8:17 12:18 22:20 25:16 **enable** 14:17 16:5 **enables** 30:18 encourage 33:22 encryption 31:3 **ended** 13:22 engage 18:9 20:22 engagement 10:9, 20 13:9 20:10 engagements 11:4 enhanced 23:9 enhancing 14:19 ensure 11:16 12:1 15:5 16:7 18:5 ensuring 12:14 **entails** 24:19 enterprise 18:7 enthusiasm 16:22 environments 24:1 EU 30:12 European 29:11, 12 30:9 evaluate 29:20 Evaluation 13:10 events 12:5, 7 evolving 12:2 examines 26:12 example 19:9 Excellent 22:10 excited 9:20 10:2 16:16 **exciting** 13:21 31:19 **exist** 16:7 existing 20:16 expanded 27:8 expanding 13:7 expansion 15:8 expertise 16:14 exploring 15:11 **exposed** 24:21 **external** 11:1, 4 extremely 14:12 extremism 11:12 12:17

<F>facilitate 7:18 20:8
false 26:17
far 19:20
February 1:12
Federal 11:21 12:9
33:13
feel 22:14 33:6
felt 19:13
finally 15:22
Financial 13:9
find 23:6
first 26:14

fiscal 13:22 14:9 15:7 **Fitzpatrick** 4:17, 18 floor 9:7 29:2 focus 29:4 focused 11:18 14:11 15:22 26:11, 15 **focusing** 12:*17* **FOIA** 13:20, 21 14:5 16:1, 3, 6 follow 25:2 34:1 following 8:15 9:2 28:3 forms 29:18 Forum 29:11 30:14 31:16 forward 10:14, 18 16:13 21:8 25:12 27:17 found 4:5 24:6, 22 **fourth** 30:15 framework 27:12 Francis 4:19, 20 free 22:14 33:6 Freedom 8:12 function 7:20 **functions** 15:13 32:19 **future** 15:5 20:17 34:3 <G>

gather 15:20 generally 17:2 **General's** 19:11 give 3:8, 14 10:11 17:14 **giving** 29:2 **glad** 17:13 go 25:10 28:13 **goal** 10:8 going 3:7, 15 4:10 7:9 8:2, 16 10:11 15:2, 4 17:8 21:13 22:3 24:13 25:11 **Good** 3:2, 3, 15 6:4, 13, 14, 19 7:16 9:17 28:22 governance 14:12 27:11 Government 30:4 grateful 33:22 Great 6:7 16:22 19:2 25:15 **greater** 21:18 greatly 10:5 **group** 25:8 **guidance** 18:2, 4

GAO 15:15

<H> half 23:3 hand 32:3 handle 14:6 handling 19:15 hands 16:19 22:14 happen 15:2 25:2 happening 24:2

designated 7:2, 4

desire 8:1

detailed 20:3

happy 21:20 Harriet 5:15 haul 15:4 **Headquarters** 12:1 **health** 12:15 hear 9:22 hearing 3:22 heavy 31:2 heightened 31:13 **held** 11:8 Hello 17:12 28:22 **help** 7:18 11:18 14:6 15:12 16:3, 7 17:3 19:14 20:6 26:18 **helped** 12:*12* helping 17:1 **helps** 13:13 Hewitt 4:21, 22 Hey 21:19 Hi 29:2 **high** 20:2, 12 higher 21:9 highlight 12:4 **highlighted** 30:10, 15 31:13, 15 **hiring** 13:16 **HOMELAND** 1:1, 20 17:2*1* homomorphic 31:3 **hopefully** 7:15 8:3 host 14:16 hosted 12:7, 9 housekeeping 6:21

< I > idea 17:15 identifiable 20:18 identifies 12:20 identify 14:17 identity 31:7 immediately 28:3 **impact** 11:13 23:20 implement 18:20 implementation 14:11 18:6 implemented 29:21 implications 12:14 importance 13:1 **important** 10:8, 10 11:12 14:12 improve 11:18 16:9 18:10 **improving** 10:9, 19 include 14:13 31:11 included 11:4, 17 18:14 20:16 **including** 12:5 13:1 15:13, 14 increase 13:16 23:14, 15 increased 21:3 23:16

incredibly 10:2 indicate 7:20 8:1 individuals 24:17 industrial 30:15 influence 32:10 **Information** 8:12, 21, 22 15:20 17:9, 20 18:2, 7, 11, 15, 21 20:4, 7, 9, 14, 18 24:11 initiatives 15:2 input 21:10 25:11 insights 27:2 inspection 33:16 **Inspector** 19:*11* **INTEGRITY** 1:3 3:5, 18 6:20 23:21 intelligence 12:6 interest 33:22 interesting 23:5 interim 27:7 internally 24:18 International 12:8 internationally 30:12 interoperable 16:8 intimately 11:13 invaluable 14:13 involve 20:17 ISAAs 20:15 issue 26:9 issued 26:20 32:20 **issues** 12:2 **ITEM** 2:2 its 15:12 19:15 20:11, 22 26:17

<J>
John 5:4
join 3:9 7:14 32:9
joining 3:21 6:15, 18
9:18

Joseph 4:21
Jr 1:21
jump 21:20 22:15
June 14:16

<K>keep 3:9 9:8, 10 33:12 key 19:9 kind 17:14, 16 King 1:21 Knight 5:1, 3 know 4:1 7:15 12:19 19:18 22:1 23:11 24:8 25:14 26:5 known 3:19 20:15 29:12, 13 31:8 Kropf 5:5, 6

<L> large 24:4

larger 21:17 25:7 launch 15:22 lawfully 30:11, 12 leaders 11:9 leading 21:3 legislation 32:11 letting 32:8 level 20:2, 12 32:12 leverage 27:3 leveraging 16:13 Liberties 12:7 linking 31:7 **Lisa** 4:9 6:3, 16 17:11, 22 21:11, 16, 19 22:12 23:1 27:22 live 7:22 8:3 localized 24:15 **location** 15:21 long 15:4 31:9 look 10:18 19:5 20:1 looked 19:10 **looking** 16:13 19:17 20:13, 14 21:8 25:12 27:17 lot 19:6, 18 **love** 26:3 lower 32:3 lowest 14:1 Luckily 24:2 **Luther** 1:21 **Lynn** 7:13 8:13 9:15, 16 22:4 26:8 28:9 32:16 33:18

< M > **Mail** 1:21 maintaining 30:19 **making** 11:18 management 19:12 **managing** 19:*16* March 33:9 Mark 4:19 **Marshall** 5:7, 8 **Martin** 1:21 massive 23:16 materials 4:4 matters 6:22 **maximum** 30:20 Mayorkas 11:7 media 4:4 meet 9:20 11:22 13:13 16:3 **MEETING** 1:3, 10 3:5, 16, 17 6:19 7:22 8:3, 22 9:19 18:11 19:2 22:7 25:7, 14 28:3 33:11, 20, 21 34:2, 4, 6 meetings 11:8 **MEMBER** 2:7, 11 7:2 8:10, 19 21:14 22:15 28:19

members 3:4, 8, 11, 21 4:10 7:6, 13, 14, 19 9:7 10:3, 8 13:15 16:11, 19 19:2 22:2 25:11, 15, 21 27:19 28:2, 20 33:2, 19 mentioned 17:22 25:6 message 13:1 met 23:2 24:10 metrics 18:16 Michael 4:17 mics 3:9 4:2 7:1 migrated 24:13, 14, 15 migration 23:11, 22 24:19 milestone 14:2 mind 9:8, 11 33:12 minutes 3:8, 14 34:2 mission 32:9 ML 31:5 model 13:11 **modern** 16:3 momentarily 3:3 monitoring 19:16 months 22:8 morning 3:2, 3, 16 6:4, 13, 14, 19 9:18 28:22 mosaic 31:8 move 13:17 14:8 28:10, 14 moved 24:1 moves 15:5 moving 10:13 24:20 multi-party 31:3 mute 4:2 6:22 9:12 **muted** 3:9 Myerson 28:21, 22 29:3 31:18 32:2

< N > name 29:2 national 31:11 32:11 near 34:3 necessary 12:3 15:20 18:20 need 15:3 16:4 **needed** 19:8 25:2 needs 32:20 new 7:12 10:2 13:14 16:1 22:1 25:10, 11, 15 26:9 28:1, 2 32:7 news 13:21 **notable** 10:12 noted 10:19 notice 9:5 **November** 19:12, 22 21:8 **number** 12:13 14:3 16:6 18:12 23:14

<0>

obviously 17:18 occurred 24:4 **OCIO** 24:11 **October** 9:1 18:1 **Odutola** 5:9, 10 offer 25:17 Office 12:2, 11, 20 13:2, 10, 15 14:5, 9, 15 15:5, 12 17:2, 19 18:8, 9, 13 19:11 20:8, 21 24:10, 11 25:5 32:15 **OFFICER** 2:5 7:13 8:12, 13 9:15 10:16 13:20 22:5 24:11 26:8 28:20 32:16, 21 33:18 **Officers** 11:20 13:9 **Officer's** 13:18 **offices** 14:21 17:21 18:10 20:11 21:1 30:4 **Office's** 8:14 9:21 10:9, 12, 20 11:19 13:5, 12 officials 12:1 **OIG** 15:15 Okay 3:15 16:19 21:13 22:13, 15 26:6 28:5, 9, 12, 13, 20 32:4, 22 33:5 ones 24:14 ongoing 9:22 **open** 9:7, 8 28:18 **OPENING** 2:4 4:9 **operate** 33:12 **operated** 30:13 operations 11:12 13:5, 21 14:22 opinions 11:3, 17 **opportunity** 3:8 11:5 15:16 16:16 **ORDER** 2:3 3:17 organizations 30:7 organize 28:7 **outline** 26:18 overnight 15:2 **oversee** 17:19 oversight 18:14 20:8 **overview** 23:13

<P>PAGE 2:2 8:22 34:2
Pahl 5:11, 12
Palmer 5:13, 14
pandemic 12:15 23:12, 17
Parker 7:14 8:13 9:16
22:5 26:8 33:18
part 10:8 19:4
participating 33:20
particular 28:8
particularly 14:4
partners 19:15 30:6
passed 25:4

patience 3:13 **Pearson** 5:15, 16 **people** 5:2 26:4 percent 23:15, 16 30:20 perfect 28:5 perimeters 30:5 **period** 9:9, 14 personal 20:18 **Phillips** 32:4, 6, 22 33:2 **phones** 9:12 PII 20:18 place 20:20 **plan** 13:13 Please 3:9 4:1, 10 6:22 7:8 9:8, 10, 12 17:2 21:21 25:21 26:5 27:18 32:16 33:6, 9, 12 **Plofchan** 5:17, 18 21:16 22:10 point 21:6 29:22 **points** 18:*3* **POLICY** 2:6, 7 8:16 11:3 13:2 17:7 18:22 19:13 23:4 26:1 27:11 portion 7:8 positions 11:10, 14 positives 26:17 possible 29:22 possibly 22:7 **posted** 34:3 **practices** 18:5 20:4 precautions 24:21 pre-register 29:1 pre-registered 28:15, 17 present 4:11, 12, 14, 16, 18, 20, 22 5:3, 6, 8, 10, 12, 14, 16, 18, 20, 22 6:2, 6, **presentation** 7:3, 19 8:15 **presentations** 7:1, 17 9:9 presenting 9:13 President 29:3 previous 27:10 prior 27:19 **priorities** 10:13 11:6 13:18 14:9, 10 29:19 priority 15:7 PRIVACY 1:3 2:5 3:5, 18 6:20 7:13 8:12, 14 9:15, 21 10:7, 9, 11, 16, 20 11:2, 5, 9, 19, 20 12:1, 2, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 14, 19, 21 13:2, 5, 15, 17, 19 14:5, 9, 10, 14, 15, 17, 18 15:5, 9, 12 17:1, 19 18:6, 8, 9, 12, 13, 14, 21 19:15 20:6, 8, 16, 21 21:4 22:5 23:21 25:5 26:8, 19 28:20 29:15 30:9 31:10 32:11, 14, 15, 21 33:18

privacycommittee@hq.dh **s.gov** 7:9, 11 8:8 33:8 **PRIVCATS** 15:10 proactively 15:6 **process** 12:22 27:3 30:12 processed 14:2 processes 15:19 19:5, 14 **processing** 16:1, 6 30:5, 19, 21 31:2 produced 27:5 professional 13:7 **Professionals** 12:8 **Program** 13:9 14:21 16:3 programs 14:22 15:18, 20 26:18 27:13 progress 8:18 promote 20:6 promoting 13:7 **proof** 30:19 **protect** 26:19 30:3 protected 30:5 protecting 10:7 **Protection** 29:11, 13, 18 30:2, 17 31:11 protections 18:14 **proud** 10:17 12:4 14:4 **provide** 8:13 9:21 12:3 16:4, 14 17:8 18:2, 13 21:2 27:10 **provided** 23:10 27:2 provides 20:5 providing 17:18 pseudonymization 29:9 30:15, 18 31:12 pseudonymizations 30:10 PTs 29:5 **PUBLIC** 2:14 3:5, 17, 21 4:3 7:4, 6, 7, 14, 15 8:6, 10 9:3, 7, 9, 19 11:13 16:5 22:7, 16 28:2, 17, 19 31:21 32:1, 2 33:3, 15, 16, 19 publicly 32:8 put 4:6 8:1 25:3

<Q>Q&A 4:2 8:20 9:14 question 3:11 8:9 9:10 25:20 28:19, 21 32:7 QUESTIONS 2:7, 11 7:3, 18 9:14 16:18 21:14, 15 22:13, 18 26:6 28:9, 12 33:2 quick 4:7 19:9 21:16 32:6 quickly 17:17 20:12 quite 24:2 < R > raised 16:20 22:14 **rapid** 29:5 **Rav** 6:7 reactively 15:7 ready 25:10 really 10:19 11:17 13:3 16:13, 20 20:10 21:5 29:13, 17 rebuilt 11:1 receive 8:16 received 9:5 recognize 13:19 recognized 29:10 recommend 29:8 recommendations 15:15 16:15 17:18 19:19 20:5 22:9 26:22 27:1, 5, 11, 14 **record** 14:2, 3 redactions 16:9 reduce 16:6 26:17 reflects 20:2 regarding 11:10 regularly 11:22 regulators 30:9 related 9:22 18:12 27:6 relationship 11:1, 19 Release 16:2 remains 14:13 **REMARKS** 2:4, 15 4:9 remember 4:1 remind 6:22 25:20 reminder 8:21 22:16 remote 23:17 repeat 7:10 **report** 19:11, 20, 21 20:2 21:7 25:4, 9 26:20 reporting 15:14 reports 27:10, 19, 20 representatives 24:12 requested 29:1 requests 14:3, 7 19:6 require 31:2 requirements 15:13 18:*6*, *12*, *21* 31:*13* research 15:1 29:9 researchers 14:17 reserved 9:3 resiliency 13:4, 17 resolving 30:16 resources 14:5 **respect** 33:10 **respond** 4:11 15:6 32:19 responding 12:16 15:14 response 6:9, 11 12:12 28:11 33:4 **returning** 7:12 10:3 review 17:17 19:22

privacycommittee 7:10

20:3 25:16 reviewing 29:5 **revitalizing** 10:22 16:22 revolution 30:16 **right** 22:15 risks 12:21 24:19 **role** 13:19 ROLL 2:3 4:7 **Romanosky** 5:19, 20 Ron 6:12 Rosal 5:7 rough 24:5 run 9:9 **Russell** 5:21, 22 < S > safely 30:4 **Sandra** 25:5 **Sandy** 6:18 21:19 25:21 27:18 28:14 31:21 **Sarah** 5:1, 4 **Sasha** 5:19 satisfies 31:12 saw 23:13 scheduling 25:7 scope 32:18 screening 26:18 **SE** 1:21 seated 22:2 seconds 3:14 **Secretary** 11:6 12:22 32:16, 21 **Secure** 16:2 **SECURITY** 1:1, 20 17:21 31:11 see 4:7 10:7 15:15 16:19 17:13 19:7 22:14 28:21 seeing 3:22 seek 15:4 selection 10:7 25:22 send 8:6 27:19 sent 12:22 serve 16:4 service 23:8 session 3:11 4:3, 5 7:5. 8 22:17 **shape** 12:12 **share** 13:20 **sharing** 17:9, 20 18:2, 7, 11, 15, 21 20:4, 7, 9, 15, 17 30:6 **Sharon** 4:11 shift 14:10 23:16 24:4 **short** 9:10 **significant** 12:13 31:14 sir 32:3 Siu 6:1.2 smooth 24:9

snowstorm 24:3 **solely** 14:11 **solution** 16:*1* 29:7 30:11 **solved** 14:18 solves 29:7 soon 4:6 8:3 **sorry** 4:*3* sort 18:16 19:7, 9 20:1 **Sotto** 4:9 6:3, 4, 16, 17 16:18 21:13, 21 22:13 25:18 27:16 28:5, 12 31:17 32:13 33:1,5 source 24:20 sources 27:7 speak 7:21 8:1 speaker 12:5 **speaking** 3:10 9:13 specific 18:16 33:10 specifically 18:3 **speed** 31:6 **spend** 13:4 **spending** 19:18 **spent** 19:2 **spots** 24:5 staff 13:8, 15 19:4, 6 21:7 **staffing** 13:*11* **stakeholders** 10:10, 21 11:14 14:16 20:22 start 3:7 4:10 15:3 **started** 3:15 10:10 starting 3:3 status 20:4 stay 24:15 steer 32:10 **Stop** 1:21 store 15:21 strengthening 11:19 SUBCOMITTEE 2:8, 12 SUBCOMMITTEE 2:6. 10 8:20 17:7 19:1 22:19, 20 23:2, 4 25:16 26:2, 4, 7 28:8 subcommittees 8:17 **submit** 8:9 33:6, 7, 9 **submitted** 19:21, 22 21:6 subsequent 26:20 succinctly 32:9 Summit 12:7, 9 Supervisor 29:12 supported 13:8 supports 13:6 **Surbhi** 6:10 sure 18:17 25:11 surveillance 30:19 sustainable 31:10 **system** 16:8 systems 15:18 16:6 23:22 24:13

<T> tagged 24:14 take 4:7 20:1 22:16 24:21 25:16 31:20 **tangible** 16:14 tasked 17:18 **TASKING** 2:13 8:21 17:10, 15, 22 18:22 22:22 23:3, 5, 6, 7 25:1 26:9, 10 27:9 28:1, 2, 9 32:20 taskings 9:2 **Taylor** 3:2 4:13, 15, 17, 19, 21 5:1, 4, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15, 17, 19, 21 6:1, 3, 5, 7, 10, 12, 14 21:19, 22 22:11 27:22 28:16 31:22 technical 14:14 TECHNOLOGIES 2:9. 12 12:18 14:19 22:20 23:9 **Technology** 8:17 15:17 25:16 26:1, 2 29:10, 20 30:16, 18 Ted 29:3 **Teitzel** 6:5, 6 22:21 23:1 26:7 telework 23:11, 18, 22 **template** 20:14 tent 7:22 tentatively 9:4 term 31:9 terrific 8:11 17:4 **Tesla** 23:14 testing 8:17 text 30:22 thank 3:12, 13 5:4 6:14, 17, 18 9:16, 17, 18 16:12, 17, 20 17:4, 11 21:22 22:10 25:18 26:10 27:16 28:6 29:2 31:16, *17*, *20* 32:*3*, *8*, *22* 33:*1* 34:5 Thanks 22:12 23:1 33:17 things 20:13, 19 21:2 think 16:21 20:5 21:5 thinking 11:17 15:3 third 18:19 26:12 **Thomas** 6:1, 7, 8 time 4:1, 2 7:2, 4 8:5, *19* 9:3, 8 13:4 16:*1*2 17:6 18:8 19:2, 5, 18 22:6 23:4 24:5 25:9 26:12 28:18 timeline 21:17 times 23:2 today 3:21 6:15, 18 7:5, 15 8:11 17:14

today's 4:5 9:19 22:17 30:1 33:20, 21 34:2 Tom 5:17 22:11 tool 15:8, 10, 12 tools 16:4 29:14 top 14:10 29:19 **topic** 26:13 track 15:9 tradeoffs 29:15 **traffic** 23:15 training 13:7 21:2 transfer 30:11 transformation 29:6 transition 23:8, 10 24:6, transmission 31:2 **travel** 30:3 treated 33:15 **tried** 13:3 trying 21:5 Tuesday 1:12 Tugnawat 6:10 **turn** 4:8 6:15 9:15 17:10 21:11 22:19 26:7 two 18:13 22:7 typically 7:22 < U > **U.S** 1:1, 20 30:13 unauthorized 31:7 **understand** 11:10 15:1 19:8, *14* underwent 23:12 unnecessary 29:15 unprotected 30:21 **UPDATE** 2:6, 10 8:14 10:11 15:16 16:21 17:4, 9 22:21 **UPDATES** 2:5 8:16 9:21, 22 upright 8:1 usage 23:15 use 7:20, 22 12:17 14:18 15:8, 11 16:8 17:2 26:11, 15, 16 27:4, 12, 20 29:7 30:1, 3, 17 uses 27:7 utility 29:16 30:20 31:6 **utilized** 18:16 < V > **value** 10:5 valued 15:16 values 13:6 various 23:22 24:19 views 27:10 violent 11:12 12:17

Virtual 1:10

vote 22:8

VPN 23:15

< W > wait 22:1 want 3:13 13:18 16:11 wanted 17:14 Washington 1:22 way 8:2 14:4 web 8:22 34:1 website 4:6 28:4 **wedded** 27:12 **Welcome** 3:4, 20 6:19 7:12 17:12 22:11 well 10:13 11:20 12:10 20:19 21:10 24:1 25:8, 17 went 24:9, 17 Whitworth 6:12, 13 **winter** 24:*3* wish 7:21 17:3 wishing 9:6 word 7:10 work 10:1, 6 13:13 16:16 17:1 23:17 26:21 32:14 34:1 workers 23:14 workflows 13:12 workforce 12:15 working 13:16 14:15 25:5 workload 14:6 workshop 14:16 World 29:10 30:2, 14 31:15 written 18:4, 17 25:10 33:6, 10, 14 < **Y** > year 10:13, 15 12:11 13:18, 22 14:9 15:8 19:3 20:1 23:2 **years** 19:17